# **Drone Delivery: Deal or No Deal**

## Assessing Feasibility of the Delivery Drone

Blane Butcher and Kok Weng Lim

Dr. Justin Boutilier

Шiī



## **Overview**

- Background
- Methodology
- Result
  - Operational feasibility
  - Financial feasibility
- Discussion & conclusion



## A history that started with a bang



 July 1849 – Austrians sent incendiary balloons to besiege Venice



## and continued

 June 1941 – Winston
 Churchill and others waiting to watch the launch of a de
 Havilland Queen Bee target drone





## **The Delivery Drone**





 2012 / 2013 – the delivery drone craze begins (medical, surveillance, inspection, small parcel, food delivery)





## **The Delivery Drone**











© 2019 MIT Center for Transportation & Logistics | Page 6

## **Delivery drone challenges**





## Methodology

### **Operational Feasibility**

- Understand regulatory landscape for drone delivery
- Define feasible metrics for drone delivery
- Operational sensitivity analysis



### **Financial Feasibility**

- Baseline financial model
- Cost sensitivity
   analysis
- Scenario analysis



## **Target Locations & Key Operational Metrics**





## **Operational Feasibility – Current Scenario**

With the current capabilities and scenario, all of the cities analyzed had less than 1% of their current deliveries feasible for drone delivery.

% of Orders Feasible for Drone Delivery (LA)



- < 1% of current deliveries are feasible for drone delivery.
- Payload is the primary constraint followed by airport proximity constraint.



## **Operational Sensitivity Analysis – Maximum Distance**

# >90% of customers (by number of orders) can be reached by drone when it can fly up to 55 miles round trip.







© 2019 MIT Center for Transportation & Logistics | Page 11

## **Operational Sensitivity Analysis – Airport Proximity**

# >80% of customers (by number of orders) can be reached by drone when it is allowed to fly 3 miles from airports.



## **Operational Sensitivity Analysis – Package Size**

### In terms of delivery package size, 50 - 60% of orders are 1.2 cu. ft. in volume.







## **Operational Feasibility – Future Scenario**

# With favorable improvement in technology and relaxation in regulations in the next 5 years, 8% - 18% of deliveries would be feasible for drone delivery.

#### **Current scenario**

#### Likely scenario in 5 years

MANAGEMENT



© 2019 MIT Center for Transportation & Logistics | Page 14

## **Financial Feasibility – Current vs Future**

### Drone delivery is only feasible under optimistic scenario as a cost saver.

**NPV** without premium charge (cost saver) Future scenarios in 5 years Current scenario Pessimistic Most likely Optimistic City/Region Los Angeles (2,745)(2,627)(919) 560 San Diego (1,377)(1,355)(558) 590 San Francisco (1, 439)(1, 427)(428) 339 Houston (1,371)(1.361)(481) (11) Dallas (1, 421)(1,464)(734) (669)

#### Cost metrics to be considered in all scenarios:



## **Financial Feasibility – Cost Saver vs Profit Driver**

# Pairing some fees with most likely and optimistic scenarios show some potential for delivery drone investment.

NPV without premium charge (cost saver) Current Scenario Descimination Most likely, Ontimistic				NPV with \$20 premium per order (profit driver)					
	Current scenario	Future scenarios in 5 years				Current	Future scenarios in 5 years		
		Pessimistic	Most likely	Optimistic		scenario	Pessimistic	Most likely	Optimistic
City/Region					City/Region				
Los Angeles	(2,745)	(2,627)	(919)	560	<ul> <li>Los Angeles</li> </ul>	(2,623)	(2,022)	1,220	6,037
<ul> <li>San Diego</li> </ul>	(1,377)	(1,355)	(558)	590	<ul> <li>San Diego</li> </ul>	(1,361)	(1,238)	582	2,808
<ul> <li>San Francisco</li> </ul>	(1,439)	(1,427)	(428)	339	<ul> <li>San Francisco</li> </ul>	(1,405)	(1,263)	53	1,494
<ul> <li>Houston</li> </ul>	(1,371)	(1,361)	(481)	(11)	<ul> <li>Houston</li> </ul>	(1,338)	(1,184)	(1)	1,072
<ul> <li>Dallas</li> </ul>	(1,421)	(1,464)	(734)	(669)	<ul> <li>Dallas</li> </ul>	(1,411)	(1,402)	(565)	(298)



## **Cost Sensitivity Analysis**

Number of drone specialists required is the most sensitive factor for drone implementation.



Level of sensitivity to NPV (Los Angeles)



Number of drone

specialists, 100%

## **Discussion & Conclusion**

- Changes in regulations
  - Line of sight to autonomous
  - Flight over populated areas
- Technology
  - Advancement in batteries
  - Increase in payload
  - Increase in range
  - All weather capability
- Watch for momentum in drone medical deliveries
- Wait for the best means of drone delivery service to emerge





### **Discussion & Conclusion**



- Understanding the complex nature of delivery drone operations
- Cost savings versus profit driving







© 2019 MIT Center for Transportation & Logistics | Page 20

# Appendices



## **Cost Sensitivity Analysis**



Cost sensitivity for Los Angeles

#### Cost sensitivity for San Francisco



■0.5x ■1.5x

#### Cost sensitivity for San Diego



#### Cost sensitivity for Dallas

-60%



#### Cost sensitivity for Houston

60%





# **Key Assumptions**

#### Drone capability assumptions:

- Speed: 35 mph
- Flight time: 1 hour

#### Initial investment cost assumptions:

- Drone price = \$10,000 per unit
- Container price = \$100 per unit, 3 cargo containers per drone
- Drone station price = \$10,000 per location (one location per depot)
- Implementation, system integration, and other administration cost = \$40,000
- The useful life of drones and containers is 5 years

#### Drone operating cost assumptions:

- Annual salary for drone specialist = \$60,000 per person.
- Drone maintenance cost (including battery, repairs, etc.) = \$0.10 per mile

#### Vehicle cost saving assumptions:

- Gas price = \$3.50 per gallon
- Energy consumption = 10 mile per gallon
- Average distance traveled per hour = 25 miles per hour



### Weight Distribution for Package Size of 1.2 cu.ft.



#### Weight distribution for package size of 1.2 cu.ft.



# Scenario Analysis – 3 possible future scenarios to be considered for financial analysis

	Current	In 5 years				
Darameters		Future Scenario 1	Future Scenario 2	Future Scenario 3		
Falameters	Base case	Pessimistics Scenario	Most likely Scenario	Optimistics Scenario		
Max Flying distance	17.5 miles	20 miles	25 miles	30 miles		
Payload	5 lb	10 lb	15 lb	20 lb		
Distance from airports	6 miles	4 miles	3 miles	2 miles		
No. of drone specialists	1 person handles 2	1 person handles 2	1 person handles 5	1 person handles 10		
required	drones	drones	drones	drones		
Total Investment cost	base case estimates	25% increase	25% reduction	25% reduction		
Drone operating cost	base case estimates based on regions	25% increase	Same as base case	25% reduction		
Gas price (\$/Gallon)	3.5	25% reduction	Same as base case	25% increase		
Driver Wage (\$/hr)	20	Base case	25% increase	50% increase		



## References

Image credit for Slide 3:

https://www.robinradar.com/press/blog/evolution-of-the-drone-threat-part-1/ Historical references for Slide 3:

The Future of Drone Use: Opportunities and Threats from Ethical and Legal Perspectives, Asser Press – Springer, chapter by Alan McKenna, page 355

Image credit for Slide 4:

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Target\_drone#/media/File:Winston\_Churchill\_and\_the\_Secr etary\_of\_State\_for\_War\_waiting\_to\_see\_the\_launch\_of\_a\_de\_Havilland\_Queen\_Bee\_r adio-controlled\_target\_drone, 6\_June 1941. H10307.jpg

Image credits for Slide 5:

https://www.amazon.com/Amazon-Prime-Air/b?ie=UTF8&node=8037720011

Videos on Slide 6:

UPS: <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xx9\_6OyjJrQ</u> Amazon: <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=98Blu9dpwHU</u> Matternet/Mercedes: <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=69lb3goYf7E</u> Flytrex: <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4g00KUjlbnE</u>

Image credit for Slide 14: <u>https://mttr.net</u>

Video on Slide 15: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dD1yyWuULCs

